

Message

---

**From:** Ex. 4 CBI [redacted]@TechLawInc.com]  
**Sent:** 5/8/2019 2:39:43 PM  
**To:** Matlock, Dennis [Matlock.Dennis@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** Re: Paden City Water status...

Dennis,

Thanks for the update. Bill said he would review our report and provide comments this week. After we finalize the report we need to meet and decide next steps.

Any updates on Leonard's?

Sent from my iPhone

On May 8, 2019, at 09:11, Matlock, Dennis <Matlock.Dennis@epa.gov> wrote:

Ex. 4 CBI [redacted]fyi

---

**From:** Smith, Bob A <Bob.A.Smith@wv.gov>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 07, 2019 5:24 PM  
**To:** Matlock, Dennis <Matlock.Dennis@epa.gov>; Huggins, William <William.Huggins@wv.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: Paden City Water status...

Here's a few messages that I shared with Charleston

Bob

Robert A. Smith, M.B.A., P.E.  
Environmental Engineering Division  
Wheeling District Office  
Office (304) 238-1145  
Cell (304) 312-0322  
[bob.a.smith@wv.gov](mailto:bob.a.smith@wv.gov)

---

**From:** Smith, Bob A  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 7, 2019 5:23 PM  
**To:** Ivey, Walter M <Walter.M.Ivey@wv.gov>; Vance, Meredith J <Meredith.J.Vance@wv.gov>; Daniels, Paul E <Paul.E.Daniels@wv.gov>  
**Cc:** Uraco, Mark A <Mark.A.Uraco@wv.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: Paden City Water status...

Update to add to my earlier message as requested from Walt

Spoke with the Chief Operator at Paden City around 5pm 5/7/19

5/6/19 council meeting with the public wasn't too bad. Thrasher (The City's Engineer did not attend). The residents and staff are coming to grips with the fact that things are progressing and funding & repairs in process

Thrasher is to install a continuous circulation pump the week of 5/13/19 to gain as much out of the current air strippers as possible. These are steps above the different tweaks over the last few months to maximize air flow, etc.,

PCS sample collected and sent to the lab on 4/18/19: No results in yet. Pace Analytical receives the samples and reportedly sends to another lab for testing. My opinion is the delay in receiving the results is too long. I called the lab last time and they immediately sent the results. I'll call again on Wed 5/8/19- I'm sure I just got lucky the first time but hopefully I'll get results

The next round of samples will be collected this Thursday 5/9/19

Thrasher has a new air stripper design in the works. Cost is expected to be \$500,000 which entails \$233,000 for the stripper units, a new building to house the strippers (I hear the strippers are too large to fit in the plant) and labor to install. Best of my knowledge the funding has not been approved

On 5/7/19 I contacted Dennis Matlock from the EPA who is heading up the clean-up/testing. This also follows up on what Meredith reported on the superfund side and any efforts to aid expediting the installation of the strippers

I reached out to Bill Huggins at DEP and will send him and Dennis these updates and share their information with you folks

Thanks

Bob

Robert A. Smith, M.B.A., P.E.  
Environmental Engineering Division  
Wheeling District Office  
Office (304) 238-1145  
Cell (304) 312-0322  
[bob.a.smith@wv.gov](mailto:bob.a.smith@wv.gov)

---

**From:** Smith, Bob A  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 7, 2019 11:56 AM  
**To:** Ivey, Walter M <[Walter.M.Ivey@wv.gov](mailto:Walter.M.Ivey@wv.gov)>  
**Cc:** Vance, Meredith J <[Meredith.J.Vance@wv.gov](mailto:Meredith.J.Vance@wv.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Paden City Water status...

Samples have been getting better (below MCL at this time), However, the average hasn't dropped much so still in violation

I called and texted the Chief Operator early this morning to find out how the 5/6/19 Council meeting (With public present) went last night-no word back yet

Reported that Thrasher has rerouted the clear well finished water through the strippers again to obtain better results-I do not believe a recent sample has been collected since this work was completed. I'll obtain more info on this

Air strippers definitely working as the last PCE samples proved the raw water (Before the strippers) was 8.5 ppb and after the strippers it was 4.9 ppb

EPA has not released a validated sample yet for their ground/soil extraction. They are suppose to share with me asap

I'll try the Chief Operator again soon and then provide another update this afternoon

Thanks

Robert A. Smith, M.B.A., P.E.  
Environmental Engineering Division  
Wheeling District Office  
Office (304) 238-1145  
Cell (304) 312-0322  
[bob.a.smith@wv.gov](mailto:bob.a.smith@wv.gov)

---

**From:** Ivey, Walter M <[Walter.M.Ivey@wv.gov](mailto:Walter.M.Ivey@wv.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 7, 2019 11:40 AM  
**To:** Smith, Bob A <[Bob.A.Smith@wv.gov](mailto:Bob.A.Smith@wv.gov)>; Vance, Meredith J <[Meredith.J.Vance@wv.gov](mailto:Meredith.J.Vance@wv.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Paden City Water status...

What is the current status of Paden City?

---

**From:** Lopez, John V <[John.V.Lopez@wv.gov](mailto:John.V.Lopez@wv.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 07, 2019 10:45 AM  
**To:** Ivey, Walter M <[Walter.M.Ivey@wv.gov](mailto:Walter.M.Ivey@wv.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Paden City Water status...

Do you have any other updates on the Paden City Water situation ?

---

**From:** Williams, Jason <[Jason.E.Williams@wv.gov](mailto:Jason.E.Williams@wv.gov)>  
**Sent:** Monday, May 6, 2019 4:33 PM  
**To:** Lopez, John V <[John.V.Lopez@wv.gov](mailto:John.V.Lopez@wv.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Paden City Water status...

*Ok. Got it. Thanks! If you learn of anything new, let me know. I appreciate ya!*

---

**From:** Lopez, John V <[John.V.Lopez@wv.gov](mailto:John.V.Lopez@wv.gov)>  
**Sent:** Monday, May 6, 2019 4:28 PM  
**To:** Williams, Jason <[Jason.E.Williams@wv.gov](mailto:Jason.E.Williams@wv.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Paden City Water status...  
**Importance:** High

This is the last update I received on 4/17/19: I have been trying to see if there is any new info, but I haven't been able to reach anybody.

**The Paden City public water system received a maximum contaminate level (MCL) violation for tetrachloroethylene (PCE) in its finished water. This MCL violation and public notice has caused much concern within the community. The Office of**

Environmental Health Services (OEHS) has been in contact with Paden City water system personnel and the City Engineer to discuss treatment processes and potential corrective actions. Testing of the public water supply for PCE occurred in March, and the results were received. The results were lower than before but still not below the MCL, therefore there will be another violation issued requiring a public notice. The City Engineer is developing short-term and long-term solutions to lower the level of PCE in the water supply. PCE is a contaminate that if exceeded, the public water system is required to notify their customers. The levels for the MCL are based on long term exposure to the chemical. The public water system is working to make improvements to reduce the level of PCE within the finished water. There are no additional sampling results at this time.

---

**From:** Williams, Jason <[Jason.E.Williams@wv.gov](mailto:Jason.E.Williams@wv.gov)>  
**Sent:** Monday, May 6, 2019 4:18 PM  
**To:** Lopez, John V <[John.V.Lopez@wv.gov](mailto:John.V.Lopez@wv.gov)>  
**Subject:** Paden City Water status...  
**Importance:** High

*Good afternoon! I just wanted to check with you to determine if anyone was able to get you any information that I can share with the constituent I mentioned below. I did not know if anything had changed since the last time we communicated about this....*

---

**From:** Williams, Jason  
**Sent:** Monday, May 6, 2019 11:57 AM  
**To:** Lopez, John V <[John.V.Lopez@wv.gov](mailto:John.V.Lopez@wv.gov)>  
**Subject:** Paden City Water status...  
**Importance:** High

Good morning!

The Governor's Office is still receiving inquiries from residents in the Paden City area concerning the status of the public water. They want to know why they are getting water that is tainted with PCE's and the content is above the "acceptable level(s)" and why BPH has not shut the system down. The calls and e-mails state that they are paying for toxic water and this is legally and morally wrong. They want clean water now, until the system is rid of the chemical.

I have to call one lady back today who left a message saying that she is going to a meeting this evening and she is going to report what I tell her. Before I call her back, can we have someone from Communications provide me with any talking points in reference to the highlighted comments/questions above?

Any information you can provide would be greatly appreciated. Thank you!

<image001.png> **Jason Williams**  
*Director of Constituent Services*  
**Office of Governor Jim Justice**  
**State Capitol**  
**1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East**  
**Charleston, WV 25305**

304-558-2000 (office)

304-558-2722 (fax)

<image002.png><image003.png><image004.png><image005.png><image006.png><image007.png>

Email correspondence to and from this email address is subject to the West Virginia Freedom of Information Act and may be disclosed, in whole or in part, to third parties by an authorized State official. It may also be privileged or otherwise protected by work product immunity or other legal rules. Unauthorized disclosure of health, legally privileged, or otherwise confidential information, is prohibited by law. If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete all records of this email.

---

**From:** Lopez, John V <[John.V.Lopez@wv.gov](mailto:John.V.Lopez@wv.gov)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, April 17, 2019 10:50 AM

**To:** Williams, Jason <[Jason.E.Williams@wv.gov](mailto:Jason.E.Williams@wv.gov)>

**Cc:** Pinnell, Kenneth L <[Kenneth.L.Pinnell@wv.gov](mailto:Kenneth.L.Pinnell@wv.gov)>; Mynes, Jennifer G <[Jennifer.G.Mynes@wv.gov](mailto:Jennifer.G.Mynes@wv.gov)>

**Subject:** FW: Paden City Water status...

Jason,

Here is the latest update:

The Paden City public water system received a maximum contaminate level (MCL) violation for tetrachloroethylene (PCE) in its finished water. This MCL violation and public notice has caused much concern within the community. The Office of Environmental Health Services (OEHS) has been in contact with Paden City water system personnel and the City Engineer to discuss treatment processes and potential corrective actions. Testing of the public water supply for PCE occurred in March, and the results were received. The results were lower than before but still not below the MCL, therefore there will be another violation issued requiring a public notice. The City Engineer is developing short-term and long-term solutions to lower the level of PCE in the water supply. PCE is a contaminate that if exceeded, the public water system is required to notify their customers. The levels for the MCL are based on long term exposure to the chemical. The public water system is working to make improvements to reduce the level of PCE within the finished water. There are no additional sampling results at this time.

Please let me know if you have any additional questions.

Thanks,

John V. Lopez, Director  
WV Department of Health and Human Resources  
Office of Constituent Services  
350 Capitol Street, Room 601  
Charleston, WV 25301  
Phone: 304-356-2000  
Email: [John.V.Lopez@WV.Gov](mailto:John.V.Lopez@WV.Gov)

---

**From:** Williams, Jason <[Jason.E.Williams@wv.gov](mailto:Jason.E.Williams@wv.gov)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, April 16, 2019 5:10 PM

**To:** Lopez, John V <[John.V.Lopez@wv.gov](mailto:John.V.Lopez@wv.gov)>

**Subject:** Paden City Water status...

Good afternoon John!

I was trying to get the status and any information I can gather regarding the Paden City Water situation. The Governor's Office is still getting calls from customers/residents who are asking why the system has not be shut down when BPH has tested and the reports keep coming back that the PCE's continue to be above the acceptable level. We are getting comments that people are paying for and using toxic water and it is being allowed by state government. They are asking for clean water, bottled water, tankers, water buffalos... They are saying that violations can be issued, but that is not giving them clean water.

Any information you can provide would be greatly appreciated. Thank you!

<image001.png> **Jason Williams**

*Director of Constituent Services*

**Office of Governor Jim Justice**

**State Capitol**

**1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East**

**Charleston, WV 25305**

304-558-2000 (office)

304-558-2722 (fax)

<image002.png><image003.png><image004.png><image005.png><image006.png><image007.png>

Email correspondence to and from this email address is subject to the West Virginia Freedom of Information Act and may be disclosed, in whole or in part, to third parties by an authorized State official. It may also be privileged or otherwise protected by work product immunity or other legal rules. Unauthorized disclosure of health, legally privileged, or otherwise confidential information, is prohibited by law. If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete all records of this email.